WASHTENAW COUNTY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS

November 15, 2023

RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

I. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

II. ROLL CALL

A session of the Washtenaw County Board of Commissioners was held at the Administration Building, in the City of Ann Arbor, Michigan, on November 15, 2023.

The meeting was called to order at 07:03 PM by Comm. Hodge, Chair of the Board of Commissioners.

Members Present: Comms. Shannon Beeman, Justin Hodge, Andy LaBarre, Crystal Lyte, Jason Maciejewski, Yousef Rabhi, Caroline Sanders, Katie Scott, Annie Somerville

Members Absent: None.

Others Present: Greg Dill, County Administrator; Andrew DeLeeuw, Interim Deputy County Administrator; Alize Asberry Payne, Racial Equity Officer; Michelle Billard, Corporation Counsel; Crystal Campbell, Public Information Officer; Tina Gavalier & Catherine Jones-Alther, Finance; Guillermo Hernandez, Director of Human Resources; Brady Peck, Director of Operations; Jason Fee, Facilities Management; Ashley Hall, BOC Communications and Operations Manager; Bryce Allmacher, Clerk’s Office; and members of the public.

III. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

1. Judith Earpe requested that the Board of Commissioners act in official opposition to MDOT's proposal to build a fence in Ann Arbor, detailed how the fence would limit options to travel by foot in both Ypsilanti and Ann Arbor.

   Carig Steffen requested that the Board allocate funding to fully implement the Washtenaw Resilience Plan. Steffen spoke in support of the resolution to oppose MDOT's proposal to build a fence through Ann Arbor on tonight's agenda.

   Pat Belancourt requested that the Board allocate funding to help the Manchester Area Seniors secure a permanent facility.

   Chris Brown spoke in support of the resolution to provide funding for senior service agencies on tonight's agenda; Brown spoke about Ypsilanti Meals on Wheels' programming in the community.

   Marie Gress gave an overview of WAVE's services in Washtenaw County; Gress recalled specific instances in which WAVE employees provided services to at-risk individuals.

Evelina Taylor invited the Commissioners to attend Town Hall being held by Wolverines on Wheels at the Michigan League on November 30th.

John Brudeau spoke in support of the resolution opposing MDOT's proposal to build a fence through Ann Arbor on tonight's agenda.

Irma Golden introduced herself to the Board of Commissioners as the current Deputy Supervisor in Superior Township and a candidate for Supervisor.

Clark Schenesky requested that the Board of Commissioners table the resolution to oppose MDOT's proposal to build a fence through Ann Arbor on tonight's agenda so that additional clauses with more specific requests may be added to that resolution.

Tara Sweider spoke in support of the resolution to oppose MDOT's proposal to build a fence through Ann Arbor on tonight's agenda; Sweider gave a brief overview of MDOT's proposal.

Brian Geringer said that the County must be unequivocal in its support of Palestine; Geringer said that the County should reduce its contributions to police and pass an ordinance similar to that of the City of Ann Arbor which bans "pretext stops."

Mary Campbell spoke about disparities in compensation between bargaining units and between upper-level and lower-level staff.

Samuel Hayes asked the Board to consider the needs of County employees; Hayes spoke about challenges staff have experienced at HAWC since it was absorbed into OCED.

Luna reiterated the words of previous commenters' thoughts on compensation for County employees; Luna requested that the Board dedicate as much money as possible to alleviate the effects of the housing and homelessness crisis.

Allison Foreman spoke about Ypsilanti Meals on Wheels' programming in the community; Foreman noted the YMOW's services extend far beyond just food delivery.

Nancy Heine said that the County Labor Relations has not negotiated in good-faith with their bargaining unit; Heine implored the Board to prioritize the welfare of County employees.

1. Written Public Comment through November 15, 2023

IV. COMMISSIONER FOLLOW-UP TO PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Comm. Beeman said that the Southwestern portion of the County is in need of additional support.

Comm. Scott said that MDOT has not been transparent in its plans for building a fence through Ann Arbor.

Comm. Rabhi thanked the HAWC call center supervisor for bringing their concerns before the Board via written public comment; Rabhi expressed concern with the compensation and benefits of HAWC employees.

Comm. Somerville noted that the allocation towards housing and homelessness being proposed in tonight's budget resolution is not as large as it needs to be, Somerville stated that she will work to increase that number.

Comm. Hodge thanked public commenters who brought attention to issues at HAWC and the desire to increase funding for senior services.

V. LIAISON REPORTS

Comm. Rabhi stated that the Washtenaw County Parks and Recreation Commission voted to expand the concessions area at the Rolling Hills Water Park and approved the acquisition of a new property in Northfield Township. Comm. Rabhi stated that the WCPARC voted to make three separate grant awards to municipalities working to expand their trail networks. Comm. Rabhi stated that rates for passes at the Mary Lou Murray Recreation Center are still highly competitive compared to neighboring communities and other organizations throughout the community.

Comm. Scott gave a report on the Homeland Security Committee meeting; Scott stated that the Committee is seeking project proposals relating to cybersecurity and community resilience.

Comm. Maciejewski stated that the Board of Public Works is still awaiting a letter from the State to proceed with the Solid Waste Management Planning process.

Comm. Lyte stated that she visited the IBEW training center; Lyte urged individuals to consider connecting with the IBEW if they are considering alternatives to a four-year degree.

Comm. Scott said that a meeting for the five-year Community Health Assessment recently took place at Washtenaw Community College; Scott stated that priority-setting is ongoing.

Comm. Sanders said that the Washtenaw County Food Policy Council will be presenting before the Board in the near future; Comm. Sanders said that two free meals will be offered at Eastern Michigan University on November 16th.

Comm. Hodge said that the Brownfield Redevelopment Authority voted to fully fund two new housing developments in the County.

VI. SPECIAL ORDER OF BUSINESS

VII. APPOINTMENTS

VIII. CONSENT AGENDA

1. Comm. Scott, seconded by Comm. Beeman, moved that the minutes of the November 1, 2023 meeting of the Board of Commissioners be approved. Voice vote - motion carried. (Complete report is on file in the County Clerk/Register's Office.)

2. Comm. Scott, seconded by Comm. Beeman, moved that the communications be received and dealt with as recommended. Voice vote - motion carried. (Complete report

is on file in the County Clerk/Register’s Office.)

R-0067 RECEIVED: October 27, 2023. Eaton County Board of Commissioners: Resolution opposing legislation which would preempt local control of solar and wind development projects.

R-0068 RECEIVED: October 31, 2023. Wexford County Board of Commissioners: Resolution opposing legislation which would preempt local control of solar and wind development projects.

R-0069 RECEIVED: November 3, 2023. Wexford County Board of Commissioners: Resolution supporting Operation Greenlight for veterans.

R-0070 RECEIVED: November 8, 2023. Bridget Mitchell, Washtenaw County Conservation District: Information on the Ottawa-Stony Management Plan survey.

R-0071 RECEIVED: November 8, 2023. Delta County Board of Commissioners: Resolution opposing legislation which would preempt local control of solar and wind development projects.

3. Comm. Scott, seconded by Comm. Beeman, moved that the following reports be received: Report of Standing Committees: Working Session (November 1, 2023). Voice vote - motion carried. (Complete report is on file in the County Clerk/Register’s Office.)

4. Comm. Scott, seconded by Comm. Beeman, moved that the following reports be received: Report of Special Committees. Voice vote - motion carried. (Complete report is on file in the County Clerk/Register’s Office.)

5. Other Reports

A. Comm. Scott, seconded by Comm. Beeman, moved that the following reports be received: A report on contracts in the amount of $25,000 and under from October 24, 2023 through November 7, 2023. Voice vote - motion carried. (Complete report is on file in the County Clerk/Register’s Office.)

B. Comm. Scott, seconded by Comm. Beeman, moved that the following reports be received: A report from the Washtenaw County Road Commission on the summary of service requests for the month of October, 2023. Voice vote - motion carried. (Complete report is on file in the County Clerk/Register’s Office.)

C. Comm. Scott, seconded by Comm. Beeman, moved that the following reports be received: A report of budget adjustments under Administrative Authority between $25,000 and $100,000 during Q3 2023. Voice vote - motion carried. (Complete report is on file in the County Clerk/Register’s Office.)

6. Report of the Treasurer - None.

IX. RESOLUTIONS

1. First Reading

A. Comm. Scott, seconded by Comm. LaBarre, moved that a resolution ratifying the application and acceptance of the connect and protect law enforcement behavioral response grant from the sheriff's office be approved. Voice vote - motion carried.

B. Comm. Scott, seconded by Comm. LaBarre, moved that a Resolution to Expand Diversion, Deflection and Violence Intervention Programming within the Washtenaw County Sheriff's Office and to Authorize the Creation and Modification of Related Program Positions from the Sheriff's Office be approved. Voice vote - motion carried.

C. Comm. Scott, seconded by Comm. LaBArre, moved that a resolution providing funding for additional senior serving agencies from Administration be approved. Voice vote - motion carried.

D. Comm. Scott, seconded by Comm. LaBarre, moved to approve a resolution to adopt the 2024-2027 Recommended Quadrennial Budget from Finance.

Comm. Scott, seconded by Comm. Somerville moved to amend this resolution to increase allocations to Food Stability (non-structurally), HAWC (structurally), and the Resiliency Office (structurally), with funding to be sourced from the elimination of the proposed Labor Relations Attorney position, allocating the undesignated BOC funding, increased budgeted CAP revenues, a partially reduced non-structural infrastructure budget, and the elimination of non-structural funding for the Resiliency Office.

Comm. Hodge noted that the amendment being proposed focuses and increases funding for three areas as compared to the original budget proposal: food stability, Housing Access for Washtenaw County, and the Washtenaw Resiliency Office.

Comm. Beeman asked whether discussion is currently limited to the amendment that has been moved.

Michelle Billard, Corporation Counsel, clarified that discussion is limited to the moved amendment.

Comm. Rabhi asked for clarification on what is covered under the non-structural infrastructure budget.

Catherine Jones-Alther, Deputy Finance Officer, stated that infrastructure has not been structurally funded since the 2008 recession and that Finance finds unallocated non-structural dollars during each budget cycle to assign to this category. Jones-Alther stated that this funding is primarily used to support facilities improvement projects at County buildings.

Hodge noted that the alterations made to the budget under this proposed amendment tend to allocate dollars across multiple categories of Board priority.

Comm. LaBarre asked the Board to consider further amending the proposed budget to increase the allocation to food security. Comm. LaBarre noted the possibility that a $300,000+ allocation to HAWC may not be in line with demand for services and the supply of housing/shelter. Comm. LaBarre noted the need for structural funding for youth services.

Comm. Somerville said that the Board should invest more in youth funding but that it is her desire that the County's structural allocation towards housing had homelessness grow closer to $1,000,000.

Comm. Scott asked for an example of a project that would be funded by the non-structural infrastructure allocation.

Jones-Alther noted that the allocation is primarily intended to offset any shortfall in Facilities' or IT's budgets.

Jason Fee, Facilities Management Director, said that various projects may be funded by this allocation, including roof and HVAC replacements.

Comm. Scott stated that she supports an allocation for food stability closer to $500,000.

Comm. Rabhi asked for clarity on the various allocations to facilities which don't fall under the non-structural allocation being discussed at the table.

Jones-Alther stated that the other allocations tend to fall under larger capital improvement and enhancement projects.

Comm. Rabhi expressed a desire for the Board to develop a longer-term strategy on human services; Comm. Rabhi said that the Board's current approach is overly reactive to in-person public comment.

Comm. Hodge said that he agrees with the concerns expressed by Comm. Rabhi; Comm. Hodge noted that recent conversations on housing and homelessness are a step in the right direction.

Administrator Dill indicated a willingness to work with the Board to develop a long-term strategy on human services.

Comm. LaBarre noted that the New Human Services Partnership was intended to fulfill a long-term vision; Comm. LaBarre said that the development of such a vision has required the Board to make reactive decisions according to needs which arise in the community which were not included in that long-term plan.

Comm. Somerville noted that the food stabilization and housing networks in the community are intertwined.

Comm. Scott indicated a desire to develop a more comprehensive strategy on human services.

Comm. Sanders, seconded by Comm. Rabhi, moved to call the question and bring the proposed amendment to a roll call vote. Roll Call Vote: YEAS 6 NAYS 3 (Beeman, LaBarre, Scott) ABSENT 0. Motion carried.

Roll Call Vote on the amendment moved by Comm. Scott: YEAS 7 NAYS 2 (Beeman, LaBarre) ABSENT 0. Motion to amend the resolution carried.

Comm. Rabhi asked about increased allocations to the Courts.

Jones-Alther said revenue shortfalls at the Courts are occurring due to the discontinuation of certain fees as a result of their participation in a program which lessens or eliminates fees proven to exacerbate poverty. Jones-Alther said that shortfalls in the past have been offset by surpluses in the Clerk's Office which the County cannot currently rely on.

Comm. Rabhi expressed a desire to hear from Court leadership on which fees they have eliminated or reduced and their intentions with doing so.

Comm. Rabhi asked about a structural allocation being made to satisfy a bond payment through the courts.

Tina Gavalier, Chief Finance Officer, stated that this allocation of approximately $800,000 is set to expire in 2028 when the bond debt has been retired.

Comm. Rabhi asked about the difference between what is being approved in the Humane Society of Huron Valley contract and what is being allocated to cover the costs of that contract.

Andrew DeLeeuw, Deputy County Administrator, stated that this difference stems from contributions made by local jurisdictions to help pay for the animal control services contract.

Comm. Rabhi said that the County should not be committing to allocating funds to HSHV beyond what it is mandated to commit. Comm. Rabhi indicated deep concern with the County's contract with HSHV and said that County municipalities should be contributing far greater amounts for animal control services.

Comm. LaBarre asked whether the infrastructure allocation is structural or non-structural.

Comm. LaBarre, seconded by Comm. Somerville, moved to amend the resolution to allocate $75,000 each year from 2024-2027 from the non-structural infrastructure allocation to youth services. This amendment stipulates the award of $25,000 each to the Student Advocacy Center, Peace Neighborhood Center, and Community Action Network in 2024. This amendment stipulates that the $75,000 be allocated through an RFP process from 2025-2027.

Comm. Rabhi, seconded by Comm. Lyte, moved to amend Comm. LaBarre's amendment so that the source of the $75,000 annual allocation to youth services come from the HSHV line item rather than the non-structural infrastructure allocation.

DeLeeuw said that the proposed amendment would not provide adequate funding to satisfy the contract with HSHV as it is currently written.

Comm. LaBarre advised caution in making this amendment. Comm. LaBarre said that his amendment was to a budget placeholder, not to a structural need already accounted for by Finance.

Comm. Beeman agreed with Comm. LaBarre's advice to vote no on this amendment. Comm. Beeman noted that the County's allocation still makes up a small percentage of HSHV's annual funding.

Comm. Scott asked whether the County's contract with HSHV is currently legally binding.

Billard stated that the County has not signed a contract with HSHV at present.

Comm. Rabhi reiterated the fact that the County is not mandated to spend the amount being proposed in this contract on animal control services.

Roll call vote on the amendment to the amendment moved by Comm. LaBarre: YEAS 3 (Rabhi, Lyte, Sanders) NAYS 6 ABSENT 0. Motion to amend the amendment failed.

Comm. Sanders offered a friendly amendment to the amendment moved by Comm. LaBarre to open a youth services RFP for all four years of the allocation, rather than allocating $25,000 to three specific organizations in 2024.

The friendly amendment was accepted by Comm. LaBarre and rejected by Comm. Somerville. The friendly amendment failed.

Comm. Sanders, seconded by Comm. Lyte, moved to amend the amendment moved by Comm. LaBarre to open a youth services RFP for all four years of the allocation, rather than allocating $25,000 to three specific organizations in 2024. Roll Call Vote: YEAS 7 NAYS 2 (Scott, Somerville) ABSENT 0. Motion to amend the amendment carried.

Comm. LaBarre, seconded by Comm. Maciejewski, moved to amend the amendment moved by Comm. LaBarre to increase the 2024-2027 youth services allocation from $75,000 to $150,000. Roll Call Vote: YEAS 5 NAYS 4 (Hodge, Lyte, Rabhi, Sanders) ABSENT 0. Motion to amend the amendment carried.

Comm. Lyte, seconded by Comm. Rabhi, moved to amend the amendment moved by Comm. LaBarre to add language stipulating that $75,000 of the allocation to youth services will be sourced from the non-structural infrastructure line item and the other $75,000 will be sourced at the discretion of the County Administrator. This amendment would additionally instruct the County Administrator to report on the impact to the County's infrastructure budget. Roll Call Vote: YEAS 9 NAYS 0 ABSENT 0. Motion to amend the amendment carried.

Roll Call Vote on the amendment, as amended, moved by Comm. LaBarre: YEAS 9 NAYS 0 ABSENT 0. The motion to amend the resolution carried.

Comm. LaBarre, seconded by Comm. Somerville, moved to amend the resolution to allocate food security funding as follows: $250,000 in 2024, $333,333 in 2025, $333,333 in 2026, and $333,334 in 2027. Roll Call Vote: YEAS 9 NAYS 0 ABSENT 0. Motion carried.

Roll Call Vote on the resolution, as amended: YEAS 9 NAYS 0 ABSENT 0

***Comm. Rabhi indicated that his YEA vote applies to the entire resolution, with the exception of the Humane Society of Huron Valley line item and the position modification for a Department of Parks and Recreation Supervisor, on which he votes NAY.**

2. Single Reading

A. **23-197** Comm. Scott, seconded by Comm. LaBarre, moved that a resolution approving the 2023 3rd Quarter General Fund and Non-General Fund Budget Non-Structural Adjustments be approved.

Comm. Rabhi asked about the $500,000 allocation to WCSO under this item.

Jones-Alther said that this money is already in the Sheriff's fund and that this clause is just meant to authorize the execution of these funds.

Roll Call Vote: YEAS 9 NAYS 0 ABSENT 0. Motion carried.

B. **23-198** Comm. Scott, seconded by Comm. LaBarre, moved that a resolution to approve the 2023 Apportionment Report from Equalization be approved. Roll Call Vote: YEAS 9 NAYS 0 ABSENT 0. Motion carried.

C. **23-199** Comm. Scott, seconded by Comm. LaBarre, moved that a resolution authorizing the County Administrator to sign a Service Contract to Provide Certain Animal Control Services with the Humane Society of Huron Valley for the period of January 1, 2024 to December 31, 2027 be approved.

Comm. Lyte asked about the possibility of moving this to a year-to-year contract.

Billard said that would require renegotiating with HSHV.

Comm. Rabhi asked about the portion of the County's contribution to HSHV earmarked for administration, wages, and benefits.

Comm. Rabhi asked for an estimate of the total cost for only County-mandated services.

HSHV representatives said that they don't collect data according to these standards.

Comm. Rabhi asked about the euthanasia costs being agreed to under this contract given the fact that HSHV is a no-kill shelter.

HSHV said that they see animals with medical circumstances which cannot be alleviated.

Comm. Sanders said that HSHV has not been a collaborative partner nor fully transparent in negotiations.

Comm. Somerville, seconded by Comm. Sanders, moved to call the question and bring the item to a roll call vote. Roll call vote 5-4 in favor. Motion failed (requires 2/3 vote).

Comm. Beeman spoke to HSHV's effectiveness as a partner and said that the Board should be seeking to fulfill and exceed its mandate.

Comm. Rabhi expressed disappointment in the Board's failure to secure a more favorable bargaining position for County staff.

Comm. Rabhi asked for clarity on HSHV's net assets.

HSHV representatives shared that the organization maintains $17 million in net assets.

Comm. LaBarre said that the County's above-mandate contribution to HSHV is in-line with the values of the Board's constituents.

Comm. Somerville, seconded by Comm. Beeman, moved to call the question and bring the item to a roll call vote. Roll Call Vote YEAS 7 NAYS 2 (Rabhi, Lyte) ABSENT 0. Motion Carried.

Roll Call Vote on the resolution: YEAS 7 NAYS 2 (Rabhi, Lyte) ABSENT 0. Motion carried.

D. **23-200** Comm. Scott, seconded by Comm. LaBarre, moved that a resolution setting the 2024 Board of Commissioners meeting calendar be approved.

Comm. Scott indicated a desire to schedule additional working sessions sometime next year.

Roll Call Vote: YEAS 9 NAYS 0 ABSENT 0. Motion carried.

E. **23-201** Comm. Scott, seconded by Comm. LaBarre, moved that a resolution in opposition to MDOT's proposal to build a fence through Ann Arbor be approved.

Comm. Hodge, seconded by Comm. Rabhi, moved to amend this resolution to instruct the County Clerk to send a copy of this resolution to all Mcihgan Counties, all Washtenaw County Cities, Villages, and Townships, and all Washtenaw County representatives in the State and Federal legislatures. Roll Call Vote: YEAS 9 NAYS 0 ABSENT 0. Motion carried.

Roll Call Vote on resolution, as amended: YEAS 9 NAYS 0 ABSENT 0. Motion carried.

F. **23-202** Comm. Scott, seconded by Comm. LaBarre, moved that a resolution declaring November 2023 Family Court Awareness Month be approved. Roll Call Vote: YEAS 9 NAYS 0 ABSENT 0. Motion carried.

3. Final Reading

A. **23-203** Comm. Scott, seconded by Comm. LaBarre, moved that a resolution to adopt the Brownfield Plan amendment for the 303 N. Fifth Ave and the 312/314 Detroit Street Brownfield Plan, Ann Arbor, MI 48104 from the Office of Community and Economic Development be approved. Roll Call Vote: YEAS 9 NAYS 0 ABSENT 0. Motion carried.

4. Approval of Claims

A. **23-204** Comm. Scott, seconded by Comm. LaBarre, moved that a resolution authorizing the payment of claims commencing with the last previously approved claim and continuing through the date of November 6, 2023 be approved. Roll Call Vote: YEAS 9 NAYS 0 ABSENT 0. Motion carried.

X. REPORT FROM THE COUNTY ADMINISTRATOR

1. Catherine Jones-Alther, Deputy Finance Officer, gave the Q3 County Budget Update.

XI. REPORT FROM THE CHAIR OF THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS

XII. ITEMS FOR CURRENT/FUTURE DISCUSSION

Comm. Rabhi asked the Adminstrator for a report on the progress made on getting municipalities to contribute towards animal control costs.

XIII. PENDING

XIV. ADJOURN TO NEXT SESSION

Comm. Scott, seconded by Comm. Beeman, moved to adjourn. Voice vote - motion carried.

The meeting adjourned at 12:08 AM.

____

Justin Hodge, Chair of the Board of Commissioners

____

Lawrence Kestenbaum, Clerk/Register

By: Bryce Allmacher, Deputy Clerk
Board Approved: December 6, 2023