

**Washtenaw County Historic District Commission  
Meeting Minutes**

|               |                                  |
|---------------|----------------------------------|
| <b>DATE:</b>  | <b>Thursday, October 7, 2021</b> |
| <b>TIME:</b>  | 5:30 pm-7:00 p.m.                |
| <b>PLACE:</b> | Virtual Zoom Meeting             |

**Call to Order**

Chair Ralph called the Washtenaw County Historic District Commission meeting to order at 5:44 PM.

**Roll Call**

- **Commissioners present:** Peter Kelley attending from Ann Arbor, Washtenaw County; Alice Ralph attending from Ann Arbor, Washtenaw County, MI; Alec Jerome attending from Dearborn, Wayne County, MI; Olivia Davidson attending from Ypsilanti Township, Washtenaw County, MI; Blake Swihart attending from Ann Arbor, Washtenaw County, MI; James Mann attending from Ypsilanti Township, Washtenaw County, MI; Aprille McKay attending from Ann Arbor, Washtenaw County, MI
- **Commissioners absent:** Katie Remensnyder, Patti Smith
- **Staff:** Melinda Schmidt, Nathan Voght
- **Public:** Sara Al-Rawi

**Approval of the Agenda of the Current Meeting:**

Chair Ralph motioned to approve the agenda of October 7, 2021 Historic District Commission meeting. Vice Chair Jerome seconded the motion. The agenda was unanimously approved.

**Approval of the Minutes of Previous Meeting: September 2, 2021:**

James Mann requested his name be added to the commissioners present at the September meeting. Chair Ralph motioned to approve the September 2, 2021 meeting minutes as amended. Commissioner Kelley seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

**Business and Reports: Staff Report**

**COA Application for 4071 Thornoaks Drive:** Staff reviewed the application to add a 12-inch overhang to the roof at 4071 Thornoaks Drive. Staff also reviewed the addendum submitted earlier in the week for an alternative plan, which included a 12-inch overhang on three elevations and a 20-inch fascia on the front facade. Staff noted an application for a 1/12-slope roof replacement had already been given administrative approval. The presented application and alternative would be installed in conjunction with the 1/12 slope roof already approved. Staff also showed the commission a drip edge fascia vent system that may be a possible alternative to propose to the builder.

Commissioner discussion: Chair Ralph commented that the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation require the roof be replaced in-kind (Standard #5). The proposed application would add an overhang or a false front, neither of which are there now. Commissioners discussed if any overhang is present on the garage or any part of the house. There is no overhang on the garage or the house.

Commissioner Ralph asked what pitch is necessary for an effective ridge vent. She discussed how a fascia vent works differently from a ridge vent. Commissioner Swihart asked if a flat roof with fascia venting would be more effective. Commissioner Jerome agreed it would be more effective. Commissioner Ralph commented that the current roof is flat with a fascia. A fascia ventilation system would be in character with the current roof.

Commissioner Jerome asked why the contractor had not considered drip edge fascia ventilation. Applicant Ms. Al-Rawi replied the contractor said the roof would not meet code without the overhang, because the ventilation system he has proposed requires an overhang. A ventilation system is necessary to keep the wood from rotting. The contractor asserts

the overhang is necessary to be up to code. Ms. Al-Rawi said the submitted plans in the application had been approved by Ann Arbor Township and the insurance company. Staff will follow up with Ann Arbor Township to clarify.

Commissioner Ralph stated there are appropriate ways to drain and ventilate flat roofs. Commissioner Jerome reminded the commission new features shall match the old in design and materials when possible. He asked if other roofers had been considered for the job. Ms. Al-Rawi replied that New Roof provided a better quality of work than the other bidders.

Commissioners discussed the appropriateness of the overhang and false front proposals. Commissioners agreed neither proposal follows the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, and that the new roof should be in-kind, without an overhang.

Commissioners discussed possible alternatives to present to the contractor, including fascia venting, which would be installed in a similar configuration with the current roof. The current roof has a fascia. Fascia venting would add a slight depth of about 1.5 inches. This would be consistent with the current features of the house.

Commissioner Jerome asked staff to discuss compliance with Ann Arbor Township, and to ask the contractor to explain why the proposed alternatives will not suit the site or fulfill compliance with Township codes. Jerome asked to table the application until more information is available.

Staff suggested the HDC schedule a special meeting to discuss the tabled application. Staff suggested the following Thursday, October 14 at 5:30pm, pending more information from the Township and contractor. Ms. Al-Rawi expressed disappointment that no decision was reached, because the water is infiltrating the house through the damaged roof and has even reached the basement. She expressed the urgency of the situation. Commissioners agreed the situation is urgent, and will work to find a solution as fast as possible.

Commissioner Kelley moved to table the 4071 COA Application for a 12-inch roof overhang until more information is available from Ann Arbor Township and the contractor; and schedule a special meeting on October 14 at 5:30 pm to discuss the application, pending sufficient information from the contractor and the township. Commissioner McKay seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

**Adjournment:** Chair Ralph motioned to adjourn the meeting at 6:27 pm. Commissioner Swihart seconded the motion. The motion was passed unanimously.

|                                                                                                                  |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| The next regularly-scheduled HDC meeting is scheduled for November 7, 2021 at 5:30 p.m. via Virtual Zoom Meeting |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|